

Advisory Committee to the Director Working Group on Diversity in the Biomedical Research Workforce

Drs. Reed Tuckson, John Ruffin, and
Lawrence Tabak
Co-Chairs
December 8, 2011

Members

- Ann Bonham, Ph.D., CSO, AAMC
- Jordan Cohen, M.D., President Emeritus, AAMC
- Jose Florez, M.D. Ph.D., Asst. Professor, Harvard Medical School
- Gary Gibbons, M.D., Professor, Morehouse School of Medicine
- Renee Jenkins, M.D., Chair Emeritus, Dept of Pediatrics and Child Health, Howard University
- Tuajuanda Jordan, PhD, Dean, Lewis & Clark College
- Wayne Riley, M.D., M.P.H., M.B.A., President & CEO, Meharry Medical College; Chair, NACMHD, NIH; Chairman, Board of Directors, AMHPS
- John Ruffin, Ph.D., Director, NIMHD, NIH – co-chair
- Samuel Silverstein, M.D., Professor, Columbia U Medical Ctr.
- Lawrence Tabak, D.D.S., Ph.D., Principal Deputy Director, NIH – co-chair
- Dana Yasu Takagi, Ph.D., Professor, UC Santa Cruz
- Reed Tuckson, M.D., Exec. VP and Chief of Med. Affairs, UnitedHealth Group – co-chair
- Maria Teresa Valez, Ph.D., Ass. Dean of the Graduate College, University of Arizona
- M. Roy Wilson, M.D., M.S., Chair, Bd. Trustees, Charles E. Drew UMS
- Keith Yamamoto, Ph.D., Exec. Vice Dean, School of Medicine, UCSF
- Clyde Yancy, M.D., FACC, GAHA, MACP, Professor, Feinberg School of Medicine

Mission and Charge

The Director of the NIH has formed a special Working Group on Diversity in the Biomedical Research Workforce (WGDBRW) as part of the Advisory Committee to the Director to conduct the following activities:

1. Examine the recently published observations by Ginther, et.al., and other available data, which describe the success rates of minority and majority applicants for extramural NIH research projects, and the success of minority investigators within the NIH intramural research program.
2. Identify the reasons for the differential success rates observed, including the potential effects of an insufficient number of minority biomedical researchers and the potential presence of a culture of unconscious or conscious bias in the grant award process among other causative factors.

Mission and Charge (cont.)

3. Recommend both immediate and long-term strategies applicable to the NIH intramural and extramural programs that address identified barriers across five key transition points in the development of a PhD or clinician scientist's career:
 - A. Entry into graduate or professional degree programs preparatory for biomedical research careers.
 - B. The transition from graduate student or MD/DDS to a post-doctoral research fellowship.
 - C. The transition from a post-doctoral position to the first employment or identification as an independent scientist.
 - D. The award of the first independent research grant from NIH or equivalent in a non-academic setting.
 - E. Establishment of an independent research program and emergence as a nationally recognized senior investigator in the field

Mission and Charge (cont.)

The WGDBRW is charged with producing interim recommendations by December 2011 and final recommendations by June 2012. In recognition of related analyses, presently in progress by the ACD Biomedical Workforce Working Group, the NIH Diversity Task Force and the NIH Women in Biomedical Research Careers Working Group, the WGDBRW seeks to work in coordination and collaboration with these groups.

Working Group Schedule of Activities

- ✓ August – Kick-off meeting
- ✓ September - Teleconference
- ✓ October - Face-to-face meeting at NIH
- ✓ November - Teleconference
- ✓ December - **Interim Report to ACD**
- ☐ March - Face-to-face meeting at NIH with Biomedical Research Workforce Task Force
- ☐ April/May – Face-to-face meeting at NIH
- ☐ June - Final Report with actionable recommendations to ACD
- ☐ Ongoing – Monthly teleconferences

What have We Learned So Far

- The Ginther *et al* paper, and its analysis, has been confirmed
 - The Working Group continues to be committed and continues to advance a data and analytic driven process: We have more to learn

Hypothesis Formulation and Exploration

- Strengthening the pipeline: increasing the numbers of researchers and their preparation to participate in the grant process
 - Exploring solutions that include:
 - A relationship with the IOM and other stakeholders to develop a mentoring program
 - Institutional mentoring
 - The provision of clearer messages by NIH leadership regarding support for programs such as RCMI, MARC, and MBRS
 - Working closely with the ACD BMW Task Force

Hypothesis Formulation and Exploration

- Exploring the possible role of bias
 - Learn more about possible role of institutional bias including further data analysis
 - Learn more about possible role of individual bias both conscious and unconscious
 - Dr. Tagaki working on exploring the causes of bias
 - Work with the Women in Biomedical Research Careers Working Group to explore the possible relationship between bias towards women and bias towards underrepresented minorities
 - Conduct a workshop to discuss experiments on the peer review system

Questions?